



# **Diversity of CO<sub>2</sub> Concentrating Mechanisms in Macroalgae Photosynthesis: A Case Study of** *Ulva* **sp.**

Jingyi Sun <sup>1,†</sup><sup>(b)</sup>, Chunyan Zhao <sup>1,2,†</sup>, Shuang Zhao <sup>1,3</sup>, Wei Dai <sup>1</sup>, Jinlin Liu <sup>1,4</sup><sup>(b)</sup>, Jianheng Zhang <sup>1,5,\*</sup><sup>(b)</sup>, Juntian Xu <sup>5,6,\*</sup> and Peimin He <sup>1,5,7,\*</sup>

- <sup>1</sup> College of Marine Ecology and Environment, Shanghai Ocean University, Shanghai 201306, China; sjyyjs2009@163.com (J.S.); zhaochunyan980204@163.com (C.Z.); zhaos@fpnu.edu.cn (S.Z.); 19521463131@139.com (W.D.); 15721539745@139.com (J.L.)
- <sup>2</sup> Shanghai Primary School of Xuhui Districy, Shanghai 201306, China
- <sup>3</sup> Ocean College, Fujian Polytechnic Normal University, Fuzhou 350300, China
- <sup>4</sup> Ocean Institute, Northwestern Polytechnical University, Taicang 215400, China
- <sup>5</sup> Co-Innovation Center of Jiangsu Marine Bio-Industry Technology, Jiangsu Ocean University, Lianyungang 222005, China
- <sup>6</sup> Jiangsu Key Laboratory for Marine Bioresources and Environment, Jiangsu Ocean University, Lianyungang 222005, China
- <sup>7</sup> Key Laboratory of Exploration and Utilization of Aquatic Genetic Resources, Ministry of Education, Shanghai Ocean University, Shanghai 201306, China
- \* Correspondence: jh-zhang@shou.edu.cn (J.Z.); jtxu@jou.edu.cn (J.X.); pmhe@shou.edu.cn (P.H.)
- These authors contributed equally to this work.

Abstract: Many algae respond to the  $CO_2$  limitation in seawater by inducing a  $CO_2$  concentrating mechanism (CCM) to obtain sufficient inorganic carbon to meet their photosynthetic needs, and *Ulva* sp. is a model population suitable for studying the ecological adaptability of macroalgae. As the dominant species of green tide disaster, *Ulva* sp. often faces strong inorganic carbon restriction due to its rapid growth and high population density and must have evolved a variety of carbon acquisition strategies, such as CCM, to overcome these limitations. This paper briefly summarizes the position and function of the important components of CCM (inorganic carbon transporters, carbonic anhydrase, Rubisco, and pyrenoid) and introduces several indexes suitable for evaluating the relative function of CCMs in macroalgae from the aspects of affinity between photosynthesis and Rubisco for  $CO_2$ , and carbonic anhydrase inhibitor. The methods of judging the carbon sequestration pathway of *Ulva* sp., the CCM responses of diversity under different carbon sources, and the related genes that may be involved in the operation of CCMs were summarized. This work could provide a reference for revealing the CCMs of macroalgae and lay a foundation for further research on the inorganic carbon utilization strategy of the *Ulva* sp.

**Keywords:** CO<sub>2</sub> concentrating mechanism; *Ulva* sp.; green tide; inorganic carbon transporters; carbonic anhydrase; Rubisco; pyrenoid

# 1. Introduction

Algae can obtain  $\text{CO}_2$ ,  $\text{HCO}_3^-$ , and  $\text{CO}_3^{2-}$  types of inorganic carbon from the ocean, but only  $\text{CO}_2$  can easily pass through the cell membrane [1].  $\text{CO}_2$  is the basic substrate of algae photosynthesis. Although seawater is rich in dissolved inorganic carbon (the concentration is as high as 2.2 mM, approximately 170 times that of the atmosphere, and  $\text{HCO}_3^-$  accounts for about 90% thereof), free  $\text{CO}_2$  accounts for less than 1% (approximately 13  $\mu$ M) and only 1/10,000 as much  $\text{CO}_2$  diffuses in seawater as it does in the atmosphere [2]. The manner of obtaining free  $\text{CO}_2$  in seawater may be limited by low diffusion coefficient and surface boundary layer range [3]. Calvin cycle is the main way of carbon sequestration in seaweed, while ribulose-1,5-diphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase (Rubisco) is the key enzyme of carbon fixation, which requires inorganic carbon in the form of  $\text{CO}_2$ . However,



Citation: Sun, J.; Zhao, C.; Zhao, S.; Dai, W.; Liu, J.; Zhang, J.; Xu, J.; He, P. Diversity of CO<sub>2</sub> Concentrating Mechanisms in Macroalgae Photosynthesis: A Case Study of *Ulva* sp. *J. Mar. Sci. Eng.* **2023**, *11*, 1911. https://doi.org/10.3390/ jmse11101911

Academic Editor: Azizur Rahman

Received: 1 September 2023 Revised: 30 September 2023 Accepted: 1 October 2023 Published: 3 October 2023



**Copyright:** © 2023 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (https:// creativecommons.org/licenses/by/ 4.0/). the need for  $CO_2$  by seaweed photosynthesis is generally higher than the  $CO_2$  concentration in natural seawater [4]. For example, the half-saturation constant  $K_m$  (DIC concentration when photosynthesis reaches half of the maximum rate) of *Ulva prolifera* to  $CO_2$  is about 250  $\mu$ M [5], while the  $CO_2$  concentration in natural seawater is only 5–25  $\mu$ M. The concentration of  $CO_2$  in the environment can not meet the needs of Rubisco, so it must rely on the  $CO_2$  concentrating mechanisms (CCMs) to increase the intracellular  $CO_2$  concentration to maintain normal photosynthesis. Therefore, CCMs evolved in most algae, including improved carbonic anhydrase (CA) activity, active absorption of  $HCO_3^-$ , and external acidification region [6,7]. In general,  $CO_2$  concentrating mechanisms refer to the sequentially acting of inorganic carbon transporters and CA in different cellular regions to change the availability of photosynthetic carbon so that  $CO_2$  accumulates in large quantities at the active site of Rubisco, which is beneficial for the enzyme to play the role of carboxylase and inhibit its oxidase activity.

*Ulva* sp. is a kind of seaweed with wide temperature, wide salt, strong stress resistance, and reproductive ability. Because of its ability to tolerate stress conditions, it has become a popular model organism for studying the biological resistance mechanism of photosynthesis [8]. Some seaweeds of Ulva sp., such as Enteromorpha (at present, it belongs to the genus Ulva, including the main population of green tide, U. prolifera, U. linza, *U. compressa*, *U. flexuosa*, etc., Figure 1), can rapidly accumulate biomass under suitable environmental conditions, causing macroalgal bloom disasters known as green tides, with serious economic and ecological consequences [9]. In the early stage of the green tide, the rapid proliferation of Enteromorpha can remove a large amount of DIC from the seawater, and the free-floating algae form an algal pad with a thickness of 0.5 m. It is difficult for the algae exposed to the atmosphere to obtain DIC from the sea to support photosynthesis, so using  $CO_2$  in the atmosphere as a carbon source leads to a decrease in the sea surface  $CO_2$  partial pressure ( $pCO_2$ ) [10,11]. It can be said that *Ulva* sp. has a high potential for adaptation to the lack of inorganic carbon. Scholars at home and abroad have done a lot of research on its origin, ecological habits, distribution characteristics, and stress resistance mechanism [8], but the research on its carbon utilization strategy is relatively scarce. Xu and Gao [12] measured the relationship between the photosynthetic oxygen evolution and the concentration of dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC) (P-C curve) in the green algae U. prolifera, which was used to reflect the relationship between photosynthesis and inorganic carbon affinity. P-C curve showed that *U. prolifera* grown under high  $CO_2$  condition had higher  $K_{1/2}$ DIC or  $K_{1/2}$ CO<sub>2</sub>. The decrease of photosynthetic affinity to DIC and/or CO<sub>2</sub> indicated that CCM or CCM activity was decreased. U. prolifera grown under the condition of low  $CO_2$  showed higher DIC affinity. In other words, when the inorganic carbon is insufficient, U. prolifera will activate the CCM to obtain enough CO<sub>2</sub> for photosynthesis. In addition, as technology advances, scientists are trying to record the overall pattern of photosynthetic carbon capture through the distribution of  ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$  in plant tissues. Liu et al. [4] demonstrated that through the corresponding changes of  $\delta^{13}$ C tissue, the relationship between the activities of  $C_3$  enzyme (Rubisco),  $C_4$  enzymes (PEP-Case, PEPCKase, and PPDKase), and CA enzymes (extra- and intra-cellular CA) and photosynthate was analyzed, and the participation of  $C_3$  and  $C_4$  photosynthetic pathways and a CA mechanism (i.e., CCM) in *U. prolifera* was determined. The results show that  $C_3$  and  $C_4$  pathways and the HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> mechanism supported by CA coexist in *U. prolifera*, which is the first report on the existence of a CCM in *Ulva* sp. [4]. Understanding the CCMs of *Ulva* sp. is of great significance for studying the CCMs of macroalgae and predicting the development trend of green tide under long-term environmental  $CO_2$  increase. Therefore, this study summarized the organization, evaluation, and operational mechanism of CCM from Ulva sp. to provide a theoretical foundation for subsequent research.



Figure 1. U. prolifera, the dominant species of the Yellow Sea green tide.

# 2. Composition of CCMs

Equal concentrations of CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>2</sub> in surface waters around 500 million years ago may have led to the emergence of algal CCMs [13]. Eukaryotic algal CCMs play an important role in global productivity, molecular phylogeny, and diversity. More than four-fifths of oceans' primary productivity is promoted by some form of CCM [14,15]. The CCM in *Ulva* sp. has three main components: (i) inorganic carbon transporters of plasma and chloroplast membranes; (ii) CAs located in key positions; and (iii) chloroplast microcompartments (pyrenoid) in which large amounts of Rubisco are accumulated [16]. Below, the roles and connections of inorganic carbon transporters, carbonic anhydrase, Rubisco, and pyrenoid in CCM are summarized.

# 2.1. Inorganic Carbon Transporters

In order to better understand CCM, it is very important to study related proteins, especially the possible existence of plasma membrane and chloroplast membrane inorganic carbon transporters.  $CO_2$  and  $HCO_3^-$  are the main sources of inorganic carbon in water. Active CCM leads to rapid uptake of inorganic carbon by plasma membrane [17]. HLA3 (high light activated 3) and LCI1 (low  $CO_2$  induced protein 1)  $HCO_3^-$  transporters have been confirmed to be involved in the active absorption of  $CO_2$  and  $HCO_3^-$  on the plasma membrane of *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii* [18]. HLA3 has the structural characteristics of hydrophilicity and transmembrane region of ABC transporter and can play a role in the form of  $HCO_3^-$  transporter on the plasma membrane under low  $CO_2$  conditions. LCI1 can not only enhance the absorption of  $HCO_3^-$ , but also proved to be necessary for active absorption of  $CO_2$  at low  $CO_2$  levels [19,20]. Wang and Spalding [21] reported that at very low  $CO_2$  concentrations, the active transport of  $HCO_3^-$  on the chloroplast envelope of *C. reinhardtii* requires LCIA, and LCIB may play a parallel role with HLA3 or LCIA in  $CO_2$  or  $HCO_3^-$  uptake pathways. So far,  $HCO_3^-$  transporters working on the plasma membrane

and chloroplast envelope of *C. reinhardtii* have been identified, but not on the thylakoid membrane. Previous studies have found that three Bestrophin genes (BST1, BST2, and BST3) located on the thylakoid membrane controlled by the main regulator 'CIA5' are necessary to transport  $HCO_3^-$  accumulated in the chloroplast matrix to the thylakoid cavity [22]. CIA5 is essential for inducing the expression of several CCM genes encoding inorganic carbon transporters HLA3 and LCI1 [23]. At present, there is a lack of systematic and in-depth study on the inorganic carbon transporters of *Ulva* species. Gao [24] found the expression of low-CO<sub>2</sub>-inducible proteins, low-CO<sub>2</sub>-inducible membrane proteins, and CIA5 in some ESTs obtained from the transcriptome sequencing of *U. prolifera*. Rautenberger [25] found four hypothetical HLA3 ABC transporter (LCIB), several ABC transporters, and a nuclear transcriptional regulator (CIA5, LCR1) of the CCM element were also found in the *U. linza* transcription group [26].

# 2.2. Carbonic Anhydrase

CA is an enzyme that catalyzes the exchange of  $CO_2$  and  $HCO_3^-$  and other reactions (hydration of small CO<sub>2</sub>-like molecules, such as COS, and CS<sub>2</sub> to form H<sub>2</sub>S, CO<sub>2</sub>, or some hydrolysis reactions) in solution [27]. Without CA, the transformation reaction between  $CO_2$  and  $HCO_3^-$  will occur; however, the mutual transformation is slow. In nature, CA has several families, denoted by the Greek letters  $\alpha$  to  $\theta$ . All CA active sites have a "bipolar" cavity, half of which are only aligned with hydrophobic amino acid residues, while the other half are aligned with hydrophilic amino acid residues. The hydrophobic part can capture CO<sub>2</sub> molecules, while the hydrophilic part is involved in the release of ions (HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and  $H^+$ ) produced by CO<sub>2</sub> hydration from the cavity. CA is widespread in photosynthetic autotrophs and plays a crucial role in the CCM that promotes the transport of  $CO_2$  to Rubisco. In addition, CA has a similar effect in all types of algae, although the types of CA are different. For example,  $\alpha$ -CA and  $\theta$ -CA catalyze the conversion of bicarbonate to CO<sub>2</sub> in green alga C. reinhardtii and diatom Phaeodactylum tricornutum, respectively [28]. Different subtypes of CA in plants and eukaryotic algae have also been described [27,29–31]. One of the most well-known functions of CA in algae is to catalyze the conversion between  $CO_2$  and  $HCO_3^{-}$ . The carboxysome CA in cyanobacteria has this effect, and the CA forms include  $\beta$ -CA [27,32],  $\epsilon$ -CA [27,33], and  $\gamma$ -CA [27,34], etc. CA with the above functions also exists in the chloroplast thylakoid lumen of eukaryotic algae, including  $\alpha$ -CA, CAH3 [35], CAH1, and  $\theta$ -CA, etc. In addition, the protein complex LCIB/C, which is associated with the chloroplast pyrenoid, was found in the matrix, and the  $\theta$ -CA-like protein may recapture  $CO_2$  that leaked from the pyrenoid [21]. In algal CCM, another function of CA is to promote the entry of external CO<sub>2</sub> from the environment. These CA located in the cell wall or periplasmic space may be able to sense the level of  $CO_2$  in the environment, maintain the chemical balance among Ci types in the periplasm, and provide sufficient Ci for plasma membrane  $HCO_3^-$  transporters or active transport of  $CO_2$ . Similarly, various CAs have been found on the cell walls of different algae, such as  $\alpha$ -CA in green algae [30,36–38]. However, studies of CA in green macroalgae are few and far between. In Ulva sp., Zhang et al. [26] found a possible  $\alpha$ -CA in U. linza, De Clerck et al. [39] annotated 9 CA homologous genes in the *U. mutabilis* genome. Wang et al. [40] cloned and identified a *U. prolifera*  $\alpha$ -CA gene sensitive to environmental changes, and then Wang et al. [41] found two  $\gamma$ -CA genes highly expressed at low pH (pH7.5).

## 2.3. Rubisco and Pyrenoid

Ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase (Rubisco) is present in all oxygenic photosynthetic organisms, participates in the effect of  $CO_2$  on green plants and photoautotrophic bacteria, and is an important enzyme in the photosynthetic  $C_3$  reaction because it catalyzes the first step of photosynthesis by integrating  $CO_2$  in the air into ribulose-1diphosphate (RuBP). It catalyzes the carboxylation of RuBP and then cleavage to form two PGA (3-phosphate-glyceric acid) molecules. Rubisco is thus the main gateway of inorganic carbon into the biosphere and has a profound impact on the global scale [42]. Although this enzyme is one of the most abundant proteins on earth, it is very inefficient [43]. Through the sequential action of inorganic carbon transporters and carbonic anhydrase in different cellular regions, CO<sub>2</sub> is actively accumulated around Rubisco [44]. Compared to ordinary enzymes, Rubisco can catalyze both carboxylation and oxygenation. It has a bifunctional property and performs either carboxylase or oxygenase activity depending on the availability of the substrate, for which both  $CO_2$  and  $O_2$  can be used [43,45,46].  $O_2$  and  $CO_2$  are competitive inhibitors of the carboxylase and oxygenase reactions, respectively. Rubisco, therefore, lies at the intersection of two opposite but interlocking cycles of photosynthetic carbon reduction (photosynthesis) and photosynthetic carbon oxidation (photorespiration) (Figure 2). When the concentration ratio of  $CO_2:O_2$  is high, Rubisco catalyzes carboxylation, which catalyzes the first key carbon fixation reaction in the Calvin cycle in photosynthesis, converting free  $CO_2$  in the atmosphere into energy storage molecules in organisms. When the concentration ratio of  $CO_2:O_2$  is low Rubisco promotes the catalyzation of oxygenation and participates in the photorespiratory cycle [45]. Since Rubisco tends to participate in oxygenase reactions and the catalytic conversion rate of active sites is low, organisms have evolved various strategies to optimize Rubisco's performance when adapting to carbon limitations in a specific environment. There are mainly two strategies developed synergistically. On the one hand, Rubisco forms with different catalytic efficiencies have evolved. On the other hand, the underlying structure evolved to ensure that Rubisco received high concentrations of  $CO_2$  substrate, often referred to as the CCM [3], for example,  $C_3$  plants capture CO<sub>2</sub> from the surrounding atmosphere by passive diffusion based on Rubisco, which has developed a high affinity for  $CO_2$ ;  $C_4$  plants that evolved from  $C_3$  ancestors added structural and biochemical specializations which allows them to concentrate CO<sub>2</sub> around the Rubisco active site [47].



**Figure 2.** Schematic diagram of Rubisco functions. RuBP is ribulose 1, 5-diphosphate, and PGA is 3-phosphoglyceric acid.

Pyrenoid is an evolutionary adaptation that enables algae to fix inorganic carbon from CO<sub>2</sub>-limited environments more efficiently. This contemporary definition was first reported in 1782, with an unannotated dot mark in a painting of *Conferva jugalis* (now Spirogyra) in the Flora Danica, one of the earliest records of pyrenoids [48]. The word pyrenoid comes from the Greek  $\pi v \rho \eta v$  (*pyren*, kernel), created by Schmitz in 1882 in a monograph on algal chloroplasts [48]. Rubisco promotes about 10<sup>14</sup> kg of carbon into the biosphere each year [49,50]. However, in many plants, the rate at which Rubisco fixes CO<sub>2</sub> at atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> levels is less than 1/3 of its maximum rate, which restricts the growth of many crops. To overcome this limitation, numerous photosynthetic organisms comprising algae increased the CO<sub>2</sub> fixation rate of Rubisco by providing it with concentrated CO<sub>2</sub>. In algae, this CCM occurs in a phase-separated organelle called the pyrenoid. Pyrenoid-based CO<sub>2</sub> concentrating mechanisms (PCCMs) mediate approximately 1/3 of the global CO<sub>2</sub> sequestration [50]. Nevertheless, not all algae have pyrenoid or CCMs. The appearance of CCM is not completely consistent with the existence of pyrenoids, which is not the only component of CCM. Kevekordes et al. [51] showed that the occurrence of CCM was not completely related to the presence of pyrenoids in *Caulerpa*.

Pyrenoids are permeable microchambers that contain tightly packed Rubisco that are present in the chloroplast stroma of many algae and operate CCM [47,52]. CCM increases the concentration of  $CO_2$  near Rubisco using an inorganic carbon pump, the synergy of one or more CA, and the packaging of Rubisco into pyrenoid [53]. Pyrenoids are found in almost all algae except Chrysophyta [53] and are relatively rare in algae with thallus but have been observed in Ulva, Monostroma, and Porphyra [54,55]. Some algae lacking pyrenoid increase the acquisition of  $CO_2$  by acidifying the extracellular environment, effluxing active protons, or exporting CA to periplasm [56]. Pyrenoids are not necessary for CCM. However, the CCM is more effective when pyrenoids are present [57]. For example, the accumulation of Ci in C. reinhardtii is 5–10 times higher than that of closely related species without pyrenoids, such as *Chloromonas* [58]. Therefore, evolutionary adaptation must take place in pyrenoids to improve the performance of the CCM. In many cases, pyrenoids and chloroplasts do not necessarily occur together. For green macroalgae, Ulvales are present in both, while in *Caulerpales*, some *Codium* and *Caulerpa* sp. have multiple chloroplasts but lack pyrenoid [51]. Most green algae contain pyrenoids, the thylakoid extends into the pyrenoid and starch grains are attached to the pyrenoid surface. The chloroplast of *Ulvales* is layered with thylakoid lumen and pyrenoid [47]. He et al. [59] reported that electron microscope photos of most *U. clathrata* showed that there were multiple pyrenoids in their chloroplasts, their morphological and structure were the same, and the pyrenoids were located in chloroplasts, oval- or bean-shaped. The pyrenoids were surrounded by starch sheaths and were connected to the thylakoid of the chloroplast through longitudinal channels extending to both ends. When cells move from a high  $CO_2$ concentration environment to a low CO<sub>2</sub> concentration environment, the ultrastructure of the pyrenoid changes greatly, and the starch sheath surrounding the pyrenoid can be rapidly formed. However, Villarejo et al. [60] have shown that the starch sheath is closely related to CCM but is not involved in the process. He et al. [59] utilized metallographic immunomolecular localization and found that Rubisco gold-labeled granules of U. clathrata were mainly distributed in the pyrenoid and starch sheath chloroplasts and were rarely distributed in the chloroplast thylakoids and stroma. The molecular localization of Rubisco activase demonstrated that it was mainly distributed in the pyrenoid and starch sheath. These results indicated that the pyrenoid (and starch sheath) of *U. clathrata* was the same as that of unicellular green algae and had a photosynthetic function. In addition, Cai et al. [61] found that CO<sub>2</sub> affects the distribution of Rubisco in U. clathrata. When CO<sub>2</sub> concentration increased, Rubisco tended to diffuse into the chloroplast matrix, and when cultured with a low concentration of CO<sub>2</sub> or without CO<sub>2</sub>, Rubisco was continuously concentrated in the pyrenoids.

#### 3. Indicators to Measure CCMs in Macroalgae

According to the different initial photosynthetic products of carbon assimilation in photosynthesis, terrestrial plants were divided into three types:  $C_3$ ,  $C_4$ , and CAM plants. The majority of the plants are  $C_3$  plants, and  $C_4$  and CAM plants developed from the  $C_3$  plants. The  $C_3$  pathway is the most common and primitive pathway among the three types of photosynthetic carbon metabolism pathways, and its initial photosynthetic product is 3-phosphoglycerate (PGA) [62]. Compared with  $C_3$  plants,  $C_4$  plants increase the CO<sub>2</sub> concentration around Rubisco through a biochemical CCM [63,64]. Terrestrial  $C_4$  plants generally have Kranz anatomy, which is necessary for most terrestrial plants to perform the  $C_4$  photosynthetic pathway [65]. The Kranz anatomy is composed of mesophyll cells and their adjacent vascular bundle sheath cells, which can effectively prevent CO<sub>2</sub> from escaping outward [66], thereby accumulating the CO<sub>2</sub> concentration at the active site of Rubisco [67]. Algae are a diverse group of aquatic organisms and do not have the Kranz anatomy of terrestrial plants. In order to adapt to the low CO<sub>2</sub> environment of

seawater, most algae have evolved a CCM to ensure the supply of  $CO_2$  for photosynthesis. Although algae do not have Kranz anatomy like terrestrial  $C_4$  plants, they still possess the photosynthetic properties of the  $C_4$  pathway [68]. An example is the use of pyruvate orthophosphate dikinase (PPDK) to catalyze the formation of phosphoenolpyruvate (PEP), the initial molecule receptor for fixed  $CO_2$ .

To assess the diversity of the CCM functions and activities in different algae, reliable metrics to measure and quantify the relative functions of CCM need to be established. As reported by Badger et al. [47], we screened out several indicators that may be suitable for measuring the CCM of macroalgae were demonstrated.

### 3.1. CO<sub>2</sub> Affinity of Photosynthesis versus Rubisco

Rubisco's low affinity for external  $CO_2$  drove the evolution of CCMs. Therefore, one of the most useful indicators of whether a photosynthetic organism has a CCM is to compare the affinity of photosynthesis for external  $CO_2$  with the affinity of Rubisco for  $CO_2$ . This approach was originally applied to higher plants, and by measuring the affinity  $K_m$ (Rubisco  $CO_2$ ) of Rubisco extracted from photosynthetic organisms to substrate  $CO_2$ , it was inferred that  $C_3$  species might require a CCM [69]. However, due to the limitation of extraction technology, the affinity determination of the photosynthetic organism Rubisco lacked accuracy. With the improvement of extraction and analysis techniques, this method has become widely used to evaluate algal CCMs. In general, the researchers measured the photosynthetic oxygen evolution rate under different inorganic carbon concentrations and used the data analysis software to fit the inorganic carbon response curve (P-C curve) by using Michaelis–Menten equation, where  $K_m$  is the substrate concentration (DIC concentration) when the photosynthetic rate is half of the maximum, from which we can infer the affinity of algae photosynthesis to  $CO_2 K_m$  (photosynthetic  $CO_2$ ). Since marine algae may experience more persistent CO<sub>2</sub> limitations than fresh- and brackish-water autotrophs, it can be assumed that the type of water environment determines the effectiveness of CCM. Comparing the in vivo photosynthesis and the in vitro carboxylation of Rubisco under ambient oxygen levels can show its ability to concentrate  $CO_2$  exceeds the level of environmental CO<sub>2</sub> [70]. For example, C. reinhardtii's ratio of K<sub>m</sub> (photosynthetic CO<sub>2</sub>) to  $K_m$  (Rubisco CO<sub>2</sub>) is approximately 1:30, and that of *Ulva* sp. is about 5–10:68 [1,71,72]. Both apparently rely on CCM to improve the efficiency of Rubisco, whereas other algae with close specific gravity may not use CCM.

#### 3.2. Effects of CA Inhibitors

Because CA is central in all chloroplast CCM models, determining the effect of CA inhibitors is useful in studying the functional aspects of algal CCM. This is especially true for chloroplast-penetrating inhibitors, such as EZA (Ethoxzolamide), which are likely to inhibit most forms of internal CA. EZA is often used to obtain low inorganic carbon affinity for photosynthesis of algae. If the algae showed low inorganic carbon affinity under the action of EZA, it is proved that there is intracellular CA-mediated CCM in the algae, but no effect may not be conclusive evidence of CCM deletion. For CA inhibitors that cannot penetrate cell membranes, such as AZA (Acetazolamide), only apply to inhibit the activity of external CA [47], the effect on the function of chloroplast CCM is less easily explained. By comparing the relative effects of EZA and AZA, the relative contributions of internal and external CA forms to photosynthetic Ci absorption can be determined (Figure 3). For example, in the study of Gao et al. [73], after adding AZA the net photosynthetic rate of U. linza decreased, and the inhibition rate was noted to be 26.26%. Compared with AZA, EZA demonstrated a higher inhibition rate of photosynthesis (75.19%), which indicated that the internal CA contributed more to the absorption of photosynthesis. Xu et al. [74] found that *U. linza* and *U. prolifera* have obvious extracellular and intracellular CA activity by using different CA inhibitors. However, extracellular CA enzyme activity itself accelerates the mutual conversion between  $HCO_3^-$  and  $CO_2$  but cannot affect the  $CO_2$  equilibrium concentration, and  $CO_2$  mainly enters the cell through passive diffusion. This indicates that

 $HCO_3^-$ -utilization in this manner does not function well at high pH (pH > 9.4) because the equilibrium concentration of  $CO_2$  is low. It is obvious that in addition to the extracellular CA catalytic utilization of  $HCO_3^-$ , there must be another means of using  $HCO_3^-$  in *U. prolifera*.



**Figure 3.** Schematic diagram of CA inhibitor actions. inCA means intracellular CA, eCA means extracellular CA, and when the CA icon is gray, CA is suppressed.

# 3.3. Using HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> as Photosynthetic Substrate

The function of HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> in photosynthesis has been perceived as a property of algae [75]. The utilization of HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> by algae depends on the involvement of external CA and plasma membrane transporters [76-78]. The use of HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> is strongly correlated with the presence of a CCM. However, some macroalgae are not only capable of utilizing  $HCO_3^-$  as a carbon source, some have demonstrated the use of  $CO_2$  in specific situations. Through the detection of  $\delta^{13}$ C isotopes in *Gracilaria* and *Ulva*, it was found that when the concentration of environmental CO<sub>2</sub> was high, there was a physiological transition from using  $HCO_3^{-}$  almost exclusively to predominantly using  $CO_2$ . At the current seawater pCO<sub>2</sub>, many macroalgae use HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> rather than dissolved CO<sub>2</sub> and utilize CA to convert  $HCO_3^{-1}$  to  $CO_2$  for use by Rubisco [79–82]. For example, Mercado et al. [83] found that under the current seawater CO<sub>2</sub> level, the chlorophyll plants U. rigida and U. compressa cannot obtain sufficient CO<sub>2</sub> through diffusion absorption alone; therefore, a CCM must be used to obtain HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>. However, macroalgae may downregulate their CCM, reduce HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> use, and become dependent on  $CO_2$  as the main carbon source when  $CO_2$  concentrations are high [1,84–86]. Consequently, when using these indicators to evaluate the CCM of Ulva sp., there may be a decrease in the use of  $HCO_3^-$  in certain circumstances, where there is still CCM activity but with a certain degree of downregulation.

# 3.4. Changes in Affinity to External Ci Depends on Growth Ci Conditions

When there is Ci limitation in the external environment, the affinity of the Ci transporter for external  $CO_2$  and  $HCO_3^-$  increases, and the intracellular and extracellular CA activity also increases. The two work together to increase the affinity of microalgae for external Ci by more than 10 times [76]. This inducible change appears to be strong evidence that cellular infrastructure is involved in supplying  $CO_2$  to Rubisco in chloroplasts. These inducible CCM are not limited to microalgae but have been observed in many macroalgae as well, including *Ulva* [1], *Gracilaria* [87], *Porphyra* [88] and *Fucus* [89]. That is, some algae may have an inducible CCM to meet their environmental needs when facing external Ci periodic constraints, while other algae may not have such a flexible arrangement.

# 4. Operation of *Ulva* sp. CCM

To determine the type of photosynthetic carbon metabolism of seaweed, it is usually investigated from two aspects: a. The flow direction of C element in photosynthetic metabo-

lites during the carbon assimilation process; b. The activity of photosynthetic enzymes in the carbon assimilation pathway. The former uses <sup>14</sup>C isotope tracing technology to focus on the radioactivity intensity of key metabolites (3-phosphoglyceric acid, malic acid, oxaloacetic acid, aspartic acid, etc.) after supplying <sup>14</sup>C to seaweed. If the initial fixed product is 3-phosphoglyceric acid (3-PGA), it may be the C<sub>3</sub> pathway. If the initial fixed products are malic acid, oxaloacetate, and aspartic acid, it may be the C<sub>4</sub> pathway. The latter can focus on the activity differences of Rubisco carboxylase and PEPC enzymes, the key enzymes of the C<sub>3</sub> and C<sub>4</sub> pathways, from an enzymatic perspective.

Enteromorpha is the dominant species of green tide, which is a large-scale algal bloom disaster. Its thick floating pad is bound to be strongly restricted by inorganic carbon (Figure 4). Thus, it must have evolved a variety of carbon acquisition strategies, such as CCM, to overcome these limitations. Karekar and Joshi [90] found in U. lactuca and U. tubulosa that <sup>14</sup>C appeared not only in 3-PGA but also in aspartic acid after feeding for 10 s, while considerable <sup>14</sup>C labeled malic acid appeared in *U. lactuca* after 30 s. Therefore, it is considered that there are both  $C_3$  and  $C_4$  pathways in *Ulva* sp. *Ulva* sp. has weak photorespiration and a low CO<sub>2</sub> compensation point, demonstrating characteristics of C<sub>4</sub> plants in gas exchange [91]. However, Beer et al. [92] examined an *Ulva* sp. alga, the <sup>14</sup>C isotope tracer results showed that approximately 90% of the radioactive <sup>14</sup>C appeared in 3-phosphoglyceric acid (3-PGA), and the Rubisco carboxylase activity was about 10-times that of the PEPC activity. At the same time, due to the efficient uptake of  $HCO_3^-$ , algae may transport high concentrations of  $CO_2$  to chloroplasts, which inhibits the activity of Rubisco oxygenase. This hypothetical inorganic carbon enrichment mechanism was confirmed in the green algae *U. compressa* and *U. fasciata*. However, after a few seconds, about 12% of the radioactive  $^{14}$ C was present in aspartic acid, indicating that *Ulva* sp. could use other metabolic pathways besides  $C_3$  pathway [93]. Xu et al. [94] and Liu et al. [4] reported that the  $C_3$  and  $C_4$  pathways and CCM coexist in *U. prolifera*. Based on the above research, we listed all Ulva sp. known to have CCMs (Table 1) and attempted to summarize the CCMs of *Ulva* sp.



Figure 4. Thick floating pad in 2018 Qingdao green tide.

*Ulva* mainly uses  $HCO_3^-$  as a carbon source in normal seawater. The CCMs have three pathways to utilize  $HCO_3^-$  (Figure 5): (i) Extracellular CA bound to the cell wall promotes the dehydration of  $HCO_3^-$ , forming  $CO_2$  in the cell membrane. (ii) When the pH of the environment is high, the low concentration of  $CO_2$  in the cell membrane induces the DIDS-sensitive membrane anion exchanger to transport  $HCO_3^-$  into the cell and, under the action of intracellular CA, dehydrated to form  $CO_2$ . (iii) The proton pump located in the cell membrane utilizes the energy generated by the hydrolysis of ATP to pump H<sup>+</sup> out of the cell membrane, forming an acidic region in the cell wall, and promoting the dehydration of  $HCO_3^-$  to form  $CO_2$ , which enters the cell membrane.

| Species        | References     |
|----------------|----------------|
| Ulva australis | [95]           |
| U. pertusa     | [96,97]        |
| U. lactuca     | [98]           |
| U. linza       | [68,99,100]    |
| U. prolifera   | [4,74,100–102] |
| U. rigida      | [1,103,104]    |
| U. compressa   | [100]          |
| U. pulchra     | [1]            |
| U. reticulata  | [1]            |

Table 1. Species of Ulva known to have CO<sub>2</sub> concentrating mechanisms (CCMs).



**Figure 5.** Model diagrams of different methods of  $CO_2$  concentrating mechanism (By Figdraw). Different colors are used to represent different molecules/ions: purple:  $HCO_3^-$ , blue:  $H_2O$ , orange:  $CO_2$ , green: H<sup>+</sup>. ① Extracellular CA bound to the cell wall promotes the dehydration of  $HCO_3^-$ , forming  $CO_2$  in the cell membrane. ② When the pH of the environment is high, the low concentration of  $CO_2$  in the cell and, under the action of intracellular CA, dehydrated to form  $CO_2$ . ③ The proton pump located in the cell membrane utilizes the energy generated by the hydrolysis of ATP to pump H<sup>+</sup> out of the cell membrane, forming an acidic region in the cell wall, and promoting the dehydration of  $HCO_3^-$  to form  $CO_2$ , which enters the cell membrane. When the environmental pH and the content of  $HCO_3^-$  were low, but the concentration of  $CO_2$  was high, *Ulva* sp. preferred to use  $CO_2$  as a carbon source, and  $CO_2$  was transported into the cells through ④ passive diffusion or ⑤ possible  $CO_2$  transporters. ⑥ NAD-ME catalyzes the oxidative decarboxylation of malic acid to produce  $CO_2$ , which is added to the Calvin cycle.

In the work of Björk et al. [105], the existence of pathway (i) in the green algae (*U. rigida* C. Ag.) was demonstrated. They believe that for *U. rigida* C. Ag., the main form of

to microalgae.

Drechsler and Beer [106] and Drechsler et al. [107] reported the mechanism of direct absorption of  $HCO_3^-$  in *Ulva* sp. (pathway (ii)). Its function is similar to the anion transport in red blood cells mediated by the anion exchange protein AE1. In subsequent studies, it was found that growing algae in high pH conditions induces an AE1-like system. In addition, AE1 plays a crucial role in the electron neutralization exchange of HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and inorganic carbon in red blood cells, which is a basic process of clearing respiratory  $CO_2$ through blood flow to the lungs [108]. Due to the functional similarity between the putative  $HCO_3^-$ -transporter of *Ulva* sp. and the anion exchange of erythrocytes, we found that there are structural similarities between them. This functional similarity, combined with the current findings at the structural level, suggests that similar HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>-transport systems exist in the cells of two different organisms: mammalian and green macroalgae [109]. That is, the uptake of  $HCO_3^-$  by *Ulva* sp. is mediated by a protein that has a function similar to that of an anion exchanger on mammalian cell membranes, especially erythrocyte cell membranes. The evidence for the absorption of HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> by *Ulva* sp. (without an external CA) is that the photosynthetic rate observed under pH 8.2 was higher than that predicted by the extracellular CO<sub>2</sub> supply, which indicates that Ci must be absorbed in the form of ions. Once inside the cell, the lower internal pH and presence of an internal CA promote the dehydration of HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>, thus providing Rubisco with sufficient CO<sub>2</sub> to meet the measured high photosynthetic rate [89].

Gao et al. [73] treated *Ulva* sp. with Tris buffer and found that it had an inhibitory effect on photosynthesis, demonstrating and reporting for the first time that the *Ulva* cell wall has an acidic region as one of the CCM pathways (pathway (iii)). Acidic regions have previously been found in other macrophytes, such as *Ruppia cirrhosa* [110], *Zostera marina, Z. noltii* [111,112], and *Laminaria saccharina* [113]. Acidic regions are created by expelling protons out of the plasma membrane, making the CO<sub>2</sub> concentration in these regions higher than its level in the medium, which can facilitate the rapid diffusion of CO<sub>2</sub> into the cell through the membrane itself or the protein pores [113,114]. The acidic region located in the cell wall of *Ulva* sp. promotes the dehydration of external HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>, and the increase of extracellular CO<sub>2</sub> concentration is conducive to the entry of CO<sub>2</sub> into the cell membrane to participate in follow-up reaction, that is, CCM of *Ulva* sp. can absorb exogenous Ci under the cooperation of acidic region and external CA.

Pathway (i) seems to be ubiquitous in *Ulva* sp., in this mechanism  $HCO_3^-$  is dehydrated outside the cell with the external CA, and then the formed  $CO_2$  is absorbed into the cell. Photosynthesis that is dependent on this mechanism is completely and selectively inhibited by CA inhibitors that do not pass through the plasma membrane (e.g., dextran-bound sulfonamide) or pass very slowly through the plasma membrane (e.g., acetazolamide), but is not sensitive to DIDS. Due to the efficient utilization of CA enzymes, this method of using  $HCO_3^-$  has a high proportion in normal seawater at pH 8.1. With the increased pH, the pathway (i) is gradually suppressed. Correspondingly, algae have evolved an inducible CCM similar to those described by several green microalgae to utilize  $HCO_3^-$  under high pH conditions. For a few green macroalgae, the photosynthesis induced by high pH could be inhibited by anion exchange protein inhibitors (DIDS). The basic mechanism is insensitive to AZA. With the support of this mechanism, photosynthesis under high pH conditions is faster than spontaneous dehydration of  $HCO_3^-$ . Therefore, the direct uptake of  $HCO_3^-$  through the plasma membrane is mediated by the anion exchangers process [115].

In addition, some studies have found that although *Ulva* sp. has high expression of key enzymes in the C<sub>4</sub> pathway under stress [68], *Ulva* sp.'s PEPCK may be involved

in other biological processes (such as gluconeogenesis or providing PEP for antibacterial intermediate metabolites) or indirectly affect CCM (by affecting amino acid metabolism and transport, indirectly affect the carbon sequestration process), and it is more likely to use NAD-ME C<sub>4</sub> type CCM to tolerate stress caused by CO<sub>2</sub> deficiency [8,116].

# 5. CCM Gene of *Ulva* sp.

Many aquatic organisms, especially green algae and cyanobacteria, have evolved CCMs to increase the concentration of intracellular CO<sub>2</sub> to compensate for the low affinity of Rubisco to CO<sub>2</sub>. For example, *Synechocystis* PCC6803, *Synechococcus* 7942, and *C. reinhardtii* are model organisms for studying CCMs. The proteins involved in the algae CCM mainly include various CA, transcriptional regulators, low CO<sub>2</sub>-inducible membrane proteins, low CO<sub>2</sub>-inducible proteins, various carrier proteins, chloroplast proton extrusion proteins, plasma membrane-type H<sup>+</sup>-ATPase (proton pump) and various key enzymes involved in the carbon fixation process (Table 2). We used SequenceServer 2.0.0.rc8 [117] to perform BLASTP alignment of the collected predicted CCM proteins using the *U. prolifera* genome data. When  $e < 10^{-5}$ , the aligned sequences were considered to have high homology (Table 2).

**Table 2.** Copy number of proteins that may be involved in algal CCM found in the *U. prolifera* genome database.

| Protein  | NCBI Accession Number | Copy Number in<br>U. prolifera genome | References                       |
|--|-----------------------|---------------------------------------|----------------------------------|
| alpha carbonic anhydrases                          | CAH1 [BAA14232]       | 5                                     | -<br>[24,25,118]                 |
|  | CAH2 [CAA38360.1]     | 5                                     |                                  |
|  | CAH3 [EDP00852.1]     | 5                                     |                                  |
| beta carbonic anhydrases                           | CAH6 [AAR82947.1]     | 0                                     |                                  |
|  | CAH8 [ABS87675.1]     | 0                                     |                                  |
| gamma carbonic anhydrase                           | CAG2 [XP_001701594]   | 3                                     | -                                |
| carboxysomal-located carbonic anhydrase            | ccaA/icfA [P27134.1]  | 0                                     | [119]                            |
| phosphoribosyl aminoimidazole carboxylase          | purK [AAB05791]       | 1                                     |                                  |
| NADH dehydrogenase                                 | ndhB [CAA46161.1]     | 0                                     |                                  |
|  | CIA5 [AAG37909.1]     | 2                                     | -<br>-<br>- [24,25,118,120]<br>- |
| nuclear transcriptional regulators of CCM elements | CIA5 [AF317732_1]     | 2                                     |                                  |
|  | LCR1 [BAD13492.1]     | 1                                     |                                  |
| low-CO <sub>2</sub> -inducible proteins            | LCIA [BAD16681.1]     | 1                                     |                                  |
|  | LCIB [BAD16682.1]     | 3                                     |                                  |
|  | LCIB [EDP04243.1]     | 3                                     |                                  |
|  | LCIC [BAD16683.1]     | 3                                     |                                  |
|  | Lci2 [AAC31958.1]     | 1                                     |                                  |
| low-CO <sub>2</sub> -inducible membrane protein    | [KAF5834422.1]        | 1                                     |                                  |
|  | LCIA [XP_001703387.1] | 0                                     | -                                |
| chloroplast carrier protein 1                      | CCP1 [EDP04147.1]     | 27                                    | - [25,118]                       |
| chloroplast proton extrusion protein               | CemA [XP_001696592]   | 1                                     |                                  |
| pyruvate orthophosphate dikinase                   | PPDK [JN222388.1]     | 4                                     | [68]                             |
|  | PPDK [JN936854.1]     | 2                                     |                                  |
| ribulose-1, 5-biphosphate carboxylase              | RuBPCase [AAR19268.1] | 2                                     | -                                |

| Protein   | NCBI Accession Number     | Copy Number in<br>U. prolifera genome | References   |
|---|---------------------------|---------------------------------------|--------------|
| high and medium affinity HCO <sub>3</sub> <sup>-</sup> transporters | SbtA [UOW71290.1]         | 0                                     | [24,121]     |
|   | BicA [Q14SY0.1]           | 1                                     |              |
| putative ABC transporter/high light-activated 3                     | MRP1/HLA3<br>[AAL35383.1] | 26                                    | [25,118,122] |
|   | HLA3 [XP_001700040.1]     | 26                                    |              |
| plasma membrane-type H+-ATPase                                      | [AQM50087.1]              | 12                                    | [73,123,124] |
|   | [P19456.2]                | 7                                     |              |
| bestrophin-like protein   | BSTs [NP_191691.2]        | 7                                     | [22]         |
| proton gradient regulation 5  | PGR5 [OAP09444.1]         | 1                                     | [44]         |
| proton gradient regulation like protein                             | PGRL1 [XP_001692513.1]    | 1                                     |              |
| flavodiiron protein B   | FlvB [AMJ52190.1]         | 2                                     |              |

# Table 2. Cont.

# 6. Conclusions

The study of the mechanism of photosynthetic carbon sequestration is the basis for understanding the photosynthetic physiology, ecological adaptation, and biomass accumulation of macroalgae, and *Ulva* sp. is a model population suitable for the study of inorganic carbon utilization of macroalgae. The green tide formed by the outbreak of *Ulva* sp. can occur all over the world, which shows the great potential of *Ulva* sp. to adapt to the limitation of inorganic carbon. Ulva sp. may form an effective adaptation strategy to survive and develop under the inorganic carbon limitation caused by high population density, which may contain diverse and flexible CCMs. So far, the CCMs of *Ulva* sp. have been reported to include: under normal seawater pH, extracellular CA, and acidic region act synergistically; when the green tide breaks out, a large number of algae cover the sea surface, resulting in a sharp increase in pH, which will induce the anion exchange protein AE to transport  $HCO_3^{-}$  into the cell. In the future ocean acidification environment, higher CO<sub>2</sub> concentration in the environment will inhibit the extracellular CA and anion exchange protein AE pathways and mainly rely on the acidic region and CO<sub>2</sub> diffusion or transport pathways; under high light stress, extracellular CA pathway and C<sub>4</sub> pathway cooperate to supplement C<sub>3</sub> cycle; in addition, *Ulva* sp. also uses NAD- ME C<sub>4</sub> type CCM to tolerate stress caused by lack of  $CO_2$ .

The study of *Ulva* sp. CCM is helpful in revealing the adaptation strategies of macroalgae to inorganic carbon limitation, but there are still some unsolved problems. The function and expression of specific genes of CCMs, the physiological function of various transporter proteins of CCMs, and the changes in cell level, expression level, and metabolite level in the response process of CCMs are all urgent problems to be solved. With the continuous advancement of science and technology, the method of multiomics has been applied to the analysis of various metabolic mechanisms of algae. By comparing the differences of *Ulva* sp. in CCM using physiology and multiomics, it may be possible to make some progress in elucidating how *U. prolifera* gains a competitive advantage and explaining the internal reasons for its success in the Yellow Sea green tide outbreak.

**Author Contributions:** Conceptualization, J.S.; methodology, J.S., C.Z., S.Z. and W.D.; writing—original draft preparation, J.S., J.L. and S.Z.; writing—review and editing, J.S., J.L. and S.Z.; supervision, P.H., J.X. and J.Z.; project administration, P.H., J.X. and J.Z.; funding acquisition, P.H. and J.Z. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

**Funding:** This work was supported by the National Key R&D Program of China (2022YFC3106001, 2022YFC3106004), Project of Prevention Strategies for Green Tides of Yellow Sea, M.N.R., Natural Science Foundation of Shanghai (21ZR1427400).

Institutional Review Board Statement: Not applicable.

Informed Consent Statement: Not applicable.

Data Availability Statement: The data are available on request.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

# Abbreviations

CCM: CO<sub>2</sub> concentrating mechanism; DIC, dissolved inorganic carbon; CA, carbonic anhydrase; PEPC, phosphoenolpyruvate carboxylase; PEPCK, phosphoenolpyruvate carboxykinase; ME, malic enzyme; NAD, nicotinamide adenine dinucleotide.

# References

- 1. Björk, M.; Haglund, K.; Ramazanov, Z.; Pedersén, M. Inducible mechanisms for HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> utilization and repression of photorespiration in protoplasts and thalli of three species of *Ulva* (Chlorophyta). *J. Phycol.* **1993**, *29*, 166–173. [CrossRef]
- Yue, G.; Wang, J.; Zhu, M.; Zhou, B. Progress of inorganic carbon acquisition by algae (I): Origen and methods of the studies. *Mar. Sci.* 2003, 27, 15–18. (In Chinese)
- Giordano, M.; Beardall, J.; Raven, J.A. CO<sub>2</sub> concentrating mechanisms in algae: Mechanisms, environmental modulation, and evolution. *Annu. Rev. Plant Biol.* 2005, 56, 99–131. [CrossRef]
- 4. Liu, D.; Ma, Q.; Valiela, I.; Anderson, D.M.; Keesing, J.K.; Gao, K.; Zhen, Y.; Sun, X.; Wang, Y. Role of C<sub>4</sub> carbon fixation in *Ulva prolifera*, the macroalga responsible for the world's largest green tides. *Commun. Biol.* **2020**, *3*, 494. [CrossRef]
- Feng, Z.; Meng, Y.; Lu, W.; Chen, Q.; Yu, K.; Cai, C.; Huo, Y.; Wu, W.; Wei, H.; He, P. Studies on photosynthesis carbon fixation and ocean acidification prevention in *Ulva prolifera* I.Rate of photosynthesis carbon fixation and seawater pH increase. *Acta Oceanol. Sin.* 2012, *34*, 162–168. (In Chinese)
- Sand-Jensen, K.; Gordon, D. Differential ability of marine and freshwater macrophytes to utilize HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and CO<sub>2</sub>. *Mar. Biol.* 1984, 80, 247–253. [CrossRef]
- Gao, G.; Liu, W.; Zhao, X.; Gao, K. Ultraviolet Radiation Stimulates Activity of CO<sub>2</sub> Concentrating Mechanisms in a Bloom-Forming Diatom Under Reduced CO<sub>2</sub> Availability. *Front. Microbiol.* 2021, 12, 651567. [CrossRef]
- Zhou, L.; Gao, S.; Li, H.; Wu, S.; Gu, W. Enzyme activities suggest that the NAD-ME C<sub>4</sub> type CCM exist in *Ulva* sp. *Algal Res.* 2020, 47, 101809. [CrossRef]
- 9. Wang, Y.; Liu, F.; Liu, X.; Shi, S.; Bi, Y.; Moejes, F.W. Comparative transcriptome analysis of four co-occurring *Ulva* species for understanding the dominance of *Ulva prolifera* in the Yellow Sea green tides. *J. Appl. Phycol.* **2019**, *31*, 3303–3316. [CrossRef]
- 10. Huan, L.; Gu, W.; Gao, S.; Wang, G. Photosynthetic activity and proteomic analysis highlights the utilization of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> by *Ulva prolifera* (Chlorophyta) for rapid growth. *J. Phycol.* **2016**, *52*, 1103–1113. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Xiong, T.; Li, H.; Yue, Y.; Hu, Y.; Zhai, W.; Xue, L.; Jiao, N.; Zhang, Y. Legacy effects of late macroalgal blooms on dissolved inorganic carbon pool through alkalinity enhancement in coastal ocean. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 2023, 57, 2186–2196. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Xu, J.; Gao, K. Future CO<sub>2</sub>-induced ocean acidification mediates the physiological performance of a green tide alga. *Plant Physiol.* 2012, 160, 1762–1769. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 13. Griffiths, H.; Meyer, M.T.; Rickaby, R.E.M. Overcoming adversity through diversity: Aquatic carbon concentrating mechanisms. *J. Exp. Bot.* **2017**, *68*, 3689–3695. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 14. Raven, J.A.; Beardall, J. The ins and outs of CO<sub>2</sub>. J. Exp. Bot. **2016**, 67, 1–13. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 15. Beardall, J.; Raven, J.A. Cyanobacteria vs green algae: Which group has the edge? J. Exp. Bot. 2017, 68, 3697–3699. [CrossRef]
- Meyer, M.; Griffiths, H. Origins and diversity of eukaryotic CO<sub>2</sub>-concentrating mechanisms: Lessons for the future. *J. Exp. Bot.* 2013, 64, 769–786. [CrossRef]
- 17. Mallikarjuna, K.; Narendra, K.; Ragalatha, R.; Rao, B.J. Elucidation and genetic intervention of CO<sub>2</sub> concentration mechanism in *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii* for increased plant primary productivity. *J. Biosci.* **2020**, *45*, 115. [CrossRef]
- 18. Gao, H.; Wang, Y.; Fei, X.; Wright, D.A.; Spalding, M.H. Expression activation and functional analysis of HLA3, a putative inorganic carbon transporter in *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii*. *Plant J. Cell Mol. Biol.* **2015**, *82*, 1–11. [CrossRef]
- Ohnishi, N.; Mukherjee, B.; Tsujikawa, T.; Yanase, M.; Nakano, H.; Moroney, J.V.; Fukuzawa, H. Expression of a low CO<sub>2</sub>-inducible protein, LCI1, increases inorganic carbon uptake in the green alga, *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii*. *Plant Cell* 2010, 22, 3105–3117. [CrossRef]
- Kono, A.; Spalding, M.H. LCI1, a *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii* plasma membrane protein, functions in active CO<sub>2</sub> uptake under low CO<sub>2</sub>. *Plant J. Cell Mol. Biol.* 2020, 102, 1127–1141. [CrossRef]
- 21. Wang, Y.; Spalding, M.H. Acclimation to very low CO<sub>2</sub>: Contribution of limiting CO<sub>2</sub> inducible proteins, LCIB and LCIA, to inorganic carbon uptake in *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii*. *Plant Physiol.* **2014**, *166*, 2040–2050. [CrossRef]

- Mukherjee, A.; Lau, C.S.; Walker, C.E.; Rai, A.K.; Prejean, C.I.; Yates, G.; Thomas, E.M.; Spencer, G.L.; David, J.V.; Mackinder, L.C.M.; et al. Thylakoid localized bestrophin-like proteins are essential for the CO<sub>2</sub> concentrating mechanism of *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii*. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 2019, *116*, 16915–16920. [CrossRef]
- 23. Santhanagopalan, I.; Wong, R.; Mathur, T.; Griffiths, H. Orchestral manoeuvres in the light: Crosstalk needed for regulation of the *Chlamydomonas* carbon concentration mechanism. *J. Exp. Bot.* **2021**, *72*, 4604–4624. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Gao, Z. Study on Ecophysiological Characteristics and Transcriptome of *Enteromorpha prolifera*. Master's Thesis, Gansu Agricultural University, Lanzhou, China, 2010.
- Rautenberger, R.; Fernández, P.A.; Strittmatter, M.; Heesch, S.; Cornwall, C.E.; Hurd, C.L.; Roleda, M.Y. Saturating light and not increased carbon dioxide under ocean acidification drives photosynthesis and growth in *Ulva rigida* (Chlorophyta). *Ecol. Evol.* 2015, *5*, 874–888. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Zhang, X.; Ye, N.; Liang, C.; Mou, S.; Xiao, F.; Xu, J.; Xu, D.; Zhuang, Z. De novo sequencing and analysis of the *Ulva linza* transcriptome to discover putative mechanisms associated with its successful colonization of coastal ecosystems. *BMC Genom.* 2012, 13, 565. [CrossRef]
- 27. Supuran, C.T. Structure and function of carbonic anhydrases. Biochem. J. 2016, 473, 2023–2032. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- DiMario, R.J.; Machingura, M.C.; Waldrop, G.L.; Moroney, J.V. The many types of carbonic anhydrases in photosynthetic organisms. *Plant Sci.* 2018, 268, 11–17. [CrossRef]
- 29. Fabre, N.; Reiter, I.M.; Becuwe-Linka, N.; Genty, B.; Rumeau, D. Characterization expression analysis of genes encoding alpha and beta carbonic anhydrases in Arabidopsis. *Plant Cell Environ.* **2007**, *30*, 617–629. [CrossRef]
- Moroney, J.V.; Ma, Y.; Frey, W.D.; Fusilier, K.A.; Pham, T.T.; Simms, T.A.; DiMario, R.J.; Yang, J.; Mukherjee, B. The carbonic anhydrase isoforms of *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii*: Intracellular location, expression, and physiological roles. *Photosyn. Res.* 2011, 109, 133–149. [CrossRef]
- 31. DiMario, R.J.; Clayton, H.; Mukherjee, A.; Ludwig, M.; Moroney, J.V. Plant carbonic anhydrases: Structures, locations, evolution, and physiological roles. *Mol. Plant* 2017, *10*, 30–46. [CrossRef]
- 32. Yu, J.W.; Price, G.D.; Song, L.; Badger, M.R. Isolation of a putative carboxysomal carbonic anhydrase gene from the cyanobacterium *Synechococcus PCC7942. Plant Physiol.* **1992**, *100*, 794–800. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 33. So, A.K.; Espie, G.S.; Williams, E.B.; Shively, J.M.; Heinhorst, S.; Cannon, G.C. A novel evolutionary lineage of carbonic anhydrase (epsilon class) is a component of the carboxysome shell. *J. Bacteriol.* **2004**, *186*, 623–630. [CrossRef]
- de Araujo, C.; Arefeen, D.; Tadesse, Y.; Long, B.M.; Price, G.D.; Rowlett, R.S.; Kimber, M.S.; Espie, G.S. Identification and characterization of a carboxysomal γ-carbonic anhydrase from the cyanobacterium *Nostoc sp. PCC* 7120. *Photosynth. Res.* 2014, 121, 135–150. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Bhattacharya, D.; Archibald, J.M.; Weber, A.P.; Reyes-Prieto, A. How do endosymbionts become organelles? Understanding early events in plastid evolution. *Bioessays* 2007, 29, 1239–1246. [CrossRef]
- Fujiwara, S.; Fukuzawa, H.; Tachiki, A.; Miyachi, S. Structure and Differential Expression of 2 Genes Encoding Carbonic Anhydrase in *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii*. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 1990, 87, 9779–9783. [CrossRef]
- 37. Rawat, M.; Moroney, J.V. Partial characterization of a new isoenzyme of carbonic anhydrase isolated from *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii*. J. Biol. Chem. **1991**, 266, 9719–9723. [CrossRef]
- 38. Tachiki, A.; Fukuzawa, H.; Miyachi, S. Characterization of Carbonic Anhydrase Isozyme CA2, Which Is the CAH2 Gene Product, in *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii*. *Biosci. Biotech. Biochem.* **1992**, *56*, 794–798. [CrossRef]
- De Clerck, O.; Kao, S.M.; Bogaert, K.A.; Blomme, J.; Foflonker, F.; Kwantes, M.; Vancaester, E.; Vanderstraeten, L.; Aydoqdu, E.; Boesqer, J.; et al. Insights into the evolution of multicellularity from the sea lettuce genome. *Curr. Biol.* 2018, 28, 2921–2933. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 40. Wang, Y.; Liu, F.; Wang, M.; Moejes, F.; Bi, Y. Characterization and transcriptional analysis of one carbonic anhydrase gene in the green-tide-forming alga *Ulva prolifera* (Ulvophyceae, Chlorophyta). *Phycol. Res.* **2020**, *68*, 90–97. [CrossRef]
- Wang, Y.; Liu, F.; Liu, M.; Shi, S.; Bi, Y.; Chen, N. Molecular cloning and transcriptional regulation of two γ-carbonic anhydrase genes in the green macroalga *Ulva prolifera*. *Genetica* 2021, 149, 63–72. [CrossRef]
- 42. Lin, M.T.; Stone, W.D.; Chaudhari, V.; Hanson, M.R. Small subunits can determine enzyme kinetics of tobacco Rubisco expressed in Escherichia coli. *Nat. Plants* **2020**, *6*, 1289–1299. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 43. Angel, S.J.; Dhandapani, R. Study of ribulose 1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase from *Sulfobacillus acidophilus* strain NY-1 isolated from Lignite Mines. *J. Environ. Sci. Nat. Res.* 2020, 18, 356–362. [CrossRef]
- 44. Burlacot, A.; Dao, O.; Auroy, P.; Burlacot, A.; Dao, O.; Auroy, P.; Cuiné, S.; Li-Beisson, Y.; Peltier, G. Alternative photosynthesis pathways drive the algal CO<sub>2</sub>-concentrating mechanism. *Nature* **2022**, *605*, 366–371. [CrossRef]
- 45. Mei, Y.; Li, H.; Xie, J.; Luo, H. Ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate Carboxylase/oxygenase (Rubisco). *Plant Physiol. Commun.* 2007, 43, 363–368. (In Chinese) [CrossRef]
- 46. Xiao, K.; Bao, P.; Bao, Q.; Jia, Y.; Huang, F.; Su, J.; Zhu, Y. Quantitative analyses of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase (RuBisCO) large-subunit genes (cbbL) in typical paddy soils. *FEMS Microbio. Ecol.* **2014**, *87*, 89–101. [CrossRef]
- Badger, M.; Andrews, T.J.; Whitney, S.M.; Ludwig, M.; Price, G.D. The diversity and coevolution of Rubisco, plastids, pyrenoids, and chloroplastbased CO<sub>2</sub>-concentrating mechanisms in algae. *Can. J. Bot.* **1998**, *76*, 1052–1071. [CrossRef]

- Meyer, M.T.; Goudet, M.M.M.; Griffiths, H. The Algal Pyrenoid. In *Photosynthesis in Algae: Biochemical and Physiological Mechanisms, Advances in Photosynthesis and Respiration* 45; Larkum, A., Grossman, A., Raven, J., Eds.; Springer Nature: Cham, Switzerland, 2020; Volume 45, pp. 179–203. [CrossRef]
- Bar-On, Y.M.; Milo, R. The global mass and average rate of Rubisco. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* 2019, 116, 4738–4743. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Fei, C.; Wilson, A.T.; Mangan, N.M.; Wingreen, N.S.; Jonikas, M.C. Modelling the pyrenoid-based CO<sub>2</sub>-concentrating mechanism provides insights into its operating principles and a roadmap for its engineering into crops. *Nat. Plants* 2022, *8*, 583–595. [CrossRef]
- 51. Kevekordes, K.; Holland, D.; Häubner, N.; Jenkins, S.; Koss, R.; Roberts, S.; Raven, J.; Scrimgeour, C.; Shelly, R.; Stojkovic, S.; et al. Inorganic carbon acquisition by eight species of *Caulerpa* (Caulerpaceae, Chlorophyta). *Phycologia* **2006**, *45*, 442–449.
- 52. Raven, J.A. Inorganic carbon acquisition by eukaryotic algae: Four current questions. *Photosynth. Res.* **2010**, *106*, 123–134. [CrossRef]
- Maberly, S.C.; Ball, L.; Raven, J.A.; Sültemeyer, D.F. Inorganic carbon acquisition by chrysophytes. J. Phycol. 2009, 45, 1052–1061. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Teng, L.; Ding, L.; Luv, Q. Microscopic observation of pyrenoids in Order *Ulvales* (Chlorophyta) collected from Qingdao coast. J. Ocean Univ. China 2011, 10, 223–228. [CrossRef]
- 55. Meyer, M.T.; Whittaker, C.; Griffiths, H. The algal pyrenoid: Key unanswered questions. *J. Exp. Bot.* **2017**, *68*, 3739–3749. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 56. Raven, J.A.; Beardall, J.; Giordano, M. Energy costs of carbon dioxide concentrating mechanisms in aquatic organisms. *Photosynth. Res.* **2014**, *121*, 111–124. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 57. Meyer, M.T.; Genkov, T.N.; Skepper, J.N.; Jouhet, J.; Mitchell, M.C.; Spreitzer, R.J.; Griffiths, H. Rubisco small-subunit α-helices control pyrenoid formation in *Chlamydomonas*. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **2012**, *109*, 19474–19479. [CrossRef]
- Morita, E.; Abe, T.; Tsuzuki, M.; Fujiwara, S.; Sato, N.; Hirata, A.; Sonoike, K.; Nozaki, H. Presence of the CO<sub>2</sub>-concentrating mechanism in some species of the pyrenoid-less free-living algal genus *Chloromonas* (Volvocales, Chlorophyta). *Planta* 1998, 204, 69–276. [CrossRef]
- 59. He, P.; Wu, Q.; Wu, W.; Lu, W.; Zhang, D.; Chen, G.; Zhang, R. Pyrenoid ultrastructure and molecular localization of Rubisco activase in *Enteromorpha clathrata*. *Shuichan Xuebao* **2004**, *28*, 255–260. (In Chinese) [CrossRef]
- 60. Villarejo, A.; Martinez, F.; Pino Plumed, M. The induction of CO<sub>2</sub> concentrating mechanism in starch-lessnmytant of *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii*. *Physiol. Plantarum* **1996**, *98*, 798–802. [CrossRef]
- 61. Cai, C.; Yin, S.; Sun, Z.; Shan, M.; Wang, Q.; Huo, Y.; He, P. Effect of CO<sub>2</sub> concentration on Rubisco concentrating in pyrenoids from *Enterwomorpha clathrata*. *Biotech. Bull.* **2009**, *S1*, 271–276. (In Chinese) [CrossRef]
- 62. Niu, S.; Jiang, G.; Li, Y. Environmental regulations of C<sub>3</sub> and C<sub>4</sub> plants. Sheng Tai Xue Bao 2004, 2, 308–314. (In Chinese)
- 63. Farquhar, G.D.; von Caemmerer, S.; Berry, J.A. Models of photosynthesis. *Plant Physiol.* 2001, 125, 42–45. [CrossRef]
- 64. Zhu, X.; Long, S.; Ort, D.R. What is the maximum efficiency with which photosynthesis can convert solar energy into biomass. *Curr. Opin. Biotechnol.* **2008**, *19*, 153–159. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Luo, Z.; Zhang, S.; Yang, B. Transformation of genes of C<sub>4</sub> photosynthetic key enzyme into C<sub>3</sub> plants. *Plant Physiol. Commun.* 2008, 44, 187–193. [CrossRef]
- 66. Dengler, N.G.; Dengler, R.E.; Donnelly, P.M.; Hattersley, P.W. Quantitative leaf anatomy of C<sub>3</sub> and C<sub>4</sub> grasses (Poaceae): Bundle sheath and mesophyll surface area relationships. *Ann. Bot.* **1994**, *73*, 241–255. [CrossRef]
- 67. Sage, R.F. C<sub>4</sub> photosynthesis in terrestrial plants does not require Kranz anatomy. Trends Plant Sci. 2002, 7, 283–285. [CrossRef]
- Xu, J.F.; Zhang, X.; Ye, N.; Zheng, Z.; Mou, S.; Dong, M.; Xu, D.; Miao, J. Activities of principal photosynthetic enzymes in green macroalga *Ulva linza*: Functional implication of C<sub>4</sub> pathway in CO<sub>2</sub> assimilation. *Sci. China Life Sci.* 2013, *56*, 571–580. [CrossRef]
- 69. Lilley, R.M.; Walker, D.A. Carbon dioxide assimilation by leaves, isolated chloroplasts, and ribulose bisphosphate carboxylase from spinach. *Plant Physiol.* **1975**, 55, 1087–1092. [CrossRef]
- Capó-Bauçà, S.; Iñiguez, C.; Aguiló-Nicolau, P.; Galmés, J. Correlative adaptation between Rubisco and CO<sub>2</sub>-concentrating mechanisms in seagrasses. *Nat. Plants* 2022, *8*, 706–716. [CrossRef]
- Beer, S.; Israel, A.; Drechsler, Z.; Cohen, Y. Photosynthesis in Ulva fasciata. V. Evidence for an inorganic carbon concentrating system, and ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase CO<sub>2</sub> kinetics. *Plant Physiol.* **1990**, *94*, 1542–1546. [CrossRef]
- 72. Axelsson, L.; Ryberg, H.; Beer, S. Two modes of bicarbonate utilization in the marine green macroalga *Ulva lactuca*. *Plant Cell Environ*. **1995**, *18*, 439–445. [CrossRef]
- 73. Gao, G.; Liu, Y.; Li, X.; Feng, Z.; Xu, J. An ocean acidification acclimatised green tide alga is robust to changes of seawater carbon chemistry but vulnerable to light stress. *PLoS ONE* **2016**, *11*, e0169040. [CrossRef]
- Xu, J.T.; Wang, X.; Zhong, Z.; Yao, D. The mechanism of the characters of inorganic carbon acquisition to temperature in two Ulva species. Sheng Tai Xue Bao 2013, 33, 7892–7897. (In Chinese) [CrossRef]
- 75. Lucas, W.J. Photosynthetic assimilation of exogenous HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> by aquatic plants. *Annu. Rev. Plant Physiol.* **1983**, 34, 71–104. [CrossRef]
- 76. Badger, M.R. The CO<sub>2</sub>-concentrating mechanism in aquatic phototrophs. *Photosynthesis* 1987, 10, 219–274. [CrossRef]
- 77. Johnston, A.M. The acquisition of inorganic carbon by marine macroalgae. Can. J. Bot. 1991, 69, 1123–1132. [CrossRef]
- Badger, M.R.; Price, G.D. The CO<sub>2</sub> concentrating mechanism in cyanobacteria and microalgae. *Physiol. Plant* 1992, 84, 606–615. [CrossRef]

- 79. Gao, K.; McKinley, K.R. Use of macroalgae for marine biomass production and CO<sub>2</sub> remediation: A review. *J. Appl. Phycol.* **1994**, *6*, 45–60. [CrossRef]
- Israel, A.; Hophy, M. Growth, photosynthetic properties and Rubisco activities and amounts of marine macroalgae grown under current and elevated seawater CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations. *Global Change Biol.* 2002, *8*, 831–840. [CrossRef]
- Badger, M.R. The role of carbonic anhydrases in photosynthetic CO<sub>2</sub> concentrating mechanisms. *Photosynth. Res.* 2003, 77, 83–94. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 82. Koch, M.S.; Bowes, G.; Ross, C.; Zhang, X. Climate change and ocean acidification effects on seagrasses and marine macroalgae. *Global Change Biol.* **2013**, *19*, 103–132. [CrossRef]
- Mercado, J.M.; Gordillo, F.J.; Figueroa, F.L.; Niell, F.X. External carbonic anhydrase and affinity for inorganic carbon in intertidal macroalgae. J. Exp. Mar. Biol. Ecol. 1998, 221, 209–220. [CrossRef]
- Gao, K.; Aruga, Y.; Asada, K.; Kiyohara, M. Influence of enhanced CO<sub>2</sub> on growth and photosynthesis of the red algae *Gracilaria* sp. And *G. chilensis*. J. Appl. Phycol. 1993, 5, 563–571. [CrossRef]
- 85. Xu, Z.; Zou, D.; Gao, K. Effects of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and phosphorus supply on growth, photosynthesis and nutrient uptake in the marine macroalga *Gracilaria lemaneiformis* (Rhodophyta). *Bot. Mar.* **2010**, *53*, 123–129. [CrossRef]
- Cornwall, C.E.; Hepburn, C.D.; Pritchard, D.; Currie, K.I.; McGraw, C.M.; Hunter, K.A.; Hurd, C.L. Carbon-Use Strategies in Macroalgae: Differential Responses to Lowered pH and Implications for Ocean Acidification. *J. Phycol.* 2012, 48, 137–144. [CrossRef]
- 87. García-Sánchez, M.J.; Fernández, J.A.; Niell, X. Effect of inorganic carbon supply on the photosynthetic physiology of *Gracilaria tenuistipitata*. *Planta* **1994**, *194*, 55–61. [CrossRef]
- 88. Mercado, J.M.; Niell, F.X.; Figueroa, F.L. Regulation of the mechanism for HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> use by the inorganic carbon level in *Porphyra leucosticta* Thur in le Jolis (Rhodophyta). *Planta* **1997**, 201, 319–325. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Johnston, A.M.; Raven, J.A. Effects of culture in high CO<sub>2</sub> on the photosynthetic physiology of Fucus serratus. *Br. Phycol. J.* 1990, 25, 75–82. [CrossRef]
- 90. Karekar, M.; Joshi, G. Photosynthetic Carbon Metabolism in Marine Algae. Bot. Mar. 1973, 16, 216–220. [CrossRef]
- 91. Colman, B. The effect of temperature and oxygen on the CO<sub>2</sub> compensation point of the marine alga *Ulva lactuca*. *Plant Cell Environ*. **1984**, 7, 619–621. [CrossRef]
- Beer, S.; Israel, A. Photosynthesis of *Ulva* sp: III. O<sub>(2)</sub> Effects, Carboxylase Activities, and the CO<sub>(2)</sub> Incorporation Pattern. *Plant Physiol.* 1986, *81*, 937–938. [CrossRef]
- 93. Lu, D. Progress on photosynthetic carbon metabolism types in marine macroalgae. Chin. J. Nat. 2013, 35, 264–273. (In Chinese)
- 94. Xu, J.; Fan, X.; Zhang, X.; Xu, D.; Mou, S.; Cao, S.; Zheng, Z.; Miao, J.; Ye, N. Evidence of coexistence of C<sub>3</sub> and C<sub>4</sub> photosynthetic pathways in a green-tide-forming alga, *Ulva prolifera*. *PLoS ONE* **2012**, *7*, e37438. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 95. Reidenbach, L.B.; Fernández, P.A.; Leal, P.P.; Noisette, F.; McGraw, C.M.; Revill, A.T.; Hurd, C.L.; Kübler, J.E. Growth, ammonium metabolism, and photosynthetic properties of *Ulva australis* (Chlorophyta) under decreasing pH and ammonium enrichment. *PLoS ONE* **2017**, *12*, e0188389. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Kim, J.; Kang, E.J.; Edwards, M.S.; Lee, K.; Jeong, H.J.; Kim, K.Y. Species-specific responses of temperate macroalgae with different photosynthetic strategies to ocean acidification: A mesocosm study. *Algae* 2016, *31*, 243–256. [CrossRef]
- Kang, J.W.; Chung, I.K. The effects of eutrophication and acidification on the ecophysiology of *Ulva pertusa* Kjellman. *J. Appl. Phycol.* 2017, 29, 2675–2683. [CrossRef]
- Liu, C.; Zou, D. Responses of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> on photosynthesis and nitrogen metabolism in *Ulva lactuca* (Chlorophyta) at different temperature levels. *Mar. Biol. Res.* 2015, *11*, 1043–1052. [CrossRef]
- 99. Gao, G.; Beardall, J.; Bao, M.; Wang, C.; Ren, W. Ocean acidification and nutrient limitation synergistically reduce growth and photosynthetic performances of a green tide alga *Ulva linza*. *Biogeosciences* **2018**, *15*, 3409–3420. [CrossRef]
- Wang, Y.; Xu, D.; Ma, J.; Zhang, X.; Fan, X.; Zhang, Y.; Wang, W.; Sun, K.; Ye, N. Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> accelerated the bloom of three *Ulva* species after one life cycle culture. *J. Appl. Phycol.* 2021, 33, 3963–3973. [CrossRef]
- 101. Li, X.; Xu, J.; He, P. Comparative research on inorganic carbon acquisition by the macroalgae *Ulva prolifera* (Chlorophyta) and *Pyropia yezoensis* (Rhodophyta). *J. Appl. Phycol.* **2016**, *28*, 491–497. [CrossRef]
- 102. Li, Y.; Zhong, J.L.; Zheng, M.; Zhuo, P.L.; Xu, N. Photoperiod mediates the effects of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> on the growth and physiological performance in the green tide alga *Ulva prolifera*. *Mar. Environ. Res.* **2018**, *141*, 24–29. [CrossRef]
- 103. Gordillo, F.J.L.; Niell, F.X.; Figueroa, F.L. Non-photosynthetic enhancement of growth by high CO<sub>2</sub> level in the nitrophilic seaweed *Ulva rigida* C. Agardh (Chlorophyta). *Biomed Life Sci.* **2001**, 213, 64–70. [CrossRef]
- 104. Gordillo, F.J.L.; Figueroa, F.L.; Niell, F.X. Photon- and carbon-use efficiency in *Ulva rigida* at different CO<sub>2</sub> and N levels. *Planta* 2003, 218, 315–322. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Björk, M.; Haglund, K.; Ramazanov, Z.; Garcia-Reina, G.; Pedersén, M. Inorganic-carbon assimilation in the green seaweed Ulva rigida C. Ag. (Chlorophyta). Planta 1992, 187, 152–156. [CrossRef]
- 106. Drechsler, Z.; Beer, S. Utilization of Inorganic Carbon by Ulva lactuca. Plant Physiol. 1991, 97, 1439–1444. [CrossRef]
- 107. Drechsler, Z.; Sharkia, R.; Cabantchik, Z.I.; Beer, S. Bicarbonate uptake in the marine macroalga *Ulva* sp. is inhibited by classical probes of anion exchange by red blood cells. *Planta* **1993**, *191*, 34–40. [CrossRef]
- Jennings, M.L. Kinetics and mechanism of anion transport in red blood cells. Annu. Rev. Physiol. 1985, 47, 519–533. [CrossRef]
  [PubMed]

- 109. Sharkia, R.; Beer, S.; Cabantchik, Z.I. A membrane-located polypeptide of *Ulva* sp. which may be involved in HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> uptake is recognized by antibodies raised against the human red-blood-cell anion-exchange protein. *Planta* **1994**, *194*, 247–249. [CrossRef]
- 110. Hellblom, F.; Axelsson, L. External HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> dehydration maintained by acid zones in the plasma membrane is an important component of the photosynthetic carbon uptake in *Ruppia cirrhosa*. *Photosynth. Res.* **2003**, 77, 173–181. [CrossRef]
- Hellblom, F.; Beer, S.; Bjork, M.; Axelsson, L. A buffer sensitive inorganic carbon utilisation system in *Zostera marina*. *Aquat. Bot.* 2001, 69, 55–62. [CrossRef]
- 112. Mercado, J.M.; Niell, F.X.; Silva, J.; Santos, R. Use of light and inorganic carbon acquisition by two morphotypes of *Zostera noltii Hornem. J. Exp. Mar. Bio. Ecol.* 2003, 297, 71–84. [CrossRef]
- Mercado, J.M.; Andría, J.R.; Pérez-Lloréns, J.L.; Vergara, J.J.; Axelsson, L. Evidence for a plasmalemma-based CO<sub>2</sub> concentrating mechanism in *Laminaria saccharina*. *Photosynth. Res.* 2006, *88*, 259–268. [CrossRef]
- 114. Axelsson, L.; Mercado, J.M.; Figueroa, F.L. Utilization of HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> at high pH by the brown macroalga *Laminaria saccharina*. *Eur. J. Phycol.* **2000**, *35*, 53–59. [CrossRef]
- 115. Larsson, C.; Axelsson, L. Bicarbonate uptake and utilization in marine macroalgae. Br. Phycol. Bull. 1999, 34, 79–86. [CrossRef]
- 116. He, L.; Zhang, X.; Wang, G. Expression analysis of phosphoenolpyruvate carboxykinase in *Porphyra haitanensis* (Rhodophyta) sporophytes and gametophytes. *Phycol. Res.* **2013**, *61*, 172–179. [CrossRef]
- 117. Priyam, A.; Woodcroft, B.; Rai, V.; Munagala, A.; Moghul, I.; Ter, F.; Gibbins, M.A.; Moon, H.; Leonard, G.; Rumpf, W.; et al. Sequenceserver: A Modern Graphical User Interface for Custom BLAST Databases, *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 2015, 36, 2922–2924. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 118. Qin, Y.; Fan, B.; Miao, G. Research Progress on the CO<sub>2</sub> Concentrating Mechanism and Its Regulation in *Chlamydomonas*. J. Anhui. Agric. Sci. 2021, 49, 7. (In Chinese)
- 119. Kaplan, A.; Ronen-Tarazi, M.; Tchernov, D.; Bonfil, D.J.; Zer, H.; Schatz, D.; Vardi, A.; Hassidim, M.; Reinhold, L. The inorganic carbon-concentrating mechanism in cyanobacteria: Induction and ecological significance. *Can. J. Bot.* **1998**, *76*, 917–924. [CrossRef]
- Toyokawa, C.; Yamano, T.; Fukuzawa, H. Pyrenoid Starch Sheath Is Required for LCIB Localization and the CO<sub>2</sub>-Concentrating Mechanism in Green Algae. *Plant Physiol.* **2020**, *182*, 1883–1893. [CrossRef]
- 121. Badger, M.R.; Price, G.D.; Long, B.M.; Woodger, F.J. The environmental plasticity and ecological genomics of the cyanobacterial CO<sub>2</sub> concentrating mechanism. *J. Exp. Bot.* **2006**, *57*, 249–265. [CrossRef]
- 122. Duanmu, D.; Miller, A.R.; Horken, K.M.; Weeks, D.P.; Spalding, M.H. Knockdown of limiting-CO<sub>2</sub>-induced gene HLA3 decreases HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> transport and photosynthetic Ci affinity in *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii*. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 2009, 106, 5990–5995. [CrossRef]
- 123. Moulin, P.; Andría, J.R.; Axelsson, L.; Mercado, J.M. Different mechanisms of inorganic carbon acquisition in red macroalgae (Rhodophyta) revealed by the use of TRIS buffer. *Aquat. Bot.* **2011**, *95*, 31–38. [CrossRef]
- 124. Stepien, C.C. Impacts of geography, taxonomy and functional group on inorganic carbon use patterns in marine macrophytes. *J. Ecol.* **2015**, *103*, 1372–1383. [CrossRef]

**Disclaimer/Publisher's Note:** The statements, opinions and data contained in all publications are solely those of the individual author(s) and contributor(s) and not of MDPI and/or the editor(s). MDPI and/or the editor(s) disclaim responsibility for any injury to people or property resulting from any ideas, methods, instructions or products referred to in the content.